\equiv Prickly Primes \equiv

Math π ath 2018 • Lewis & Clark College



Sam Vandervelde • Proof School • July 3, 2018

There are four main categories of **primes**:

• Primes ending in 9 (fickle primes)

There are four main categories of **primes:**

Primes ending in 9 (fickle primes)
Primes ending in 7 (sickly primes)

- Primes ending in 9 (fickle primes)
- Primes ending in 7 (sickly primes)
- Primes ending in 3 (tricky primes)

- Primes ending in 9 (fickle primes)
- Primes ending in 7 (sickly primes)
- Primes ending in 3 (tricky primes)
- Primes ending in 1 (prickly primes)

- Primes ending in 9 (fickle primes)
- Primes ending in 7 (sickly primes)
- Primes ending in 3 (tricky primes)
- Primes ending in 1 (prickly primes)
- All the rest of them:

- Primes ending in 9 (fickle primes)
- Primes ending in 7 (sickly primes)
- Primes ending in 3 (tricky primes)
- Primes ending in 1 (prickly primes)
- All the rest of them: 2 and 5

What do you know about prickly primes?

æ

< 17 ▶

What do you know about prickly primes?

The first prickly prime is: 1

- The first prickly prime is: 11
- The seventh prickly prime is:

- The first prickly prime is: 11
- The seventh prickly prime is: 131
- How many prickly primes are there?

- The first prickly prime is: **11**
- The seventh prickly prime is: 131
- How many prickly primes are there? ∞
- How hard is this to prove?

- The first prickly prime is: **11**
- The seventh prickly prime is: 131
- How many prickly primes are there? ∞
- How hard is this to prove? **KindaHard**TM

What fraction of primes are prickly?

æ

- < f →

What fraction of primes are prickly? 1/4

How hard is this to prove?

What fraction of primes are prickly? 1/4How hard is this to prove? **SoopaHard**TM

What type of cactus is this?



Sam Vandervelde Prickly Primes

What fraction of primes are prickly? 1/4How hard is this to prove? **SoopaHard**TM What type of cactus is this? **prickly pear**



Sam Vandervelde Prickly Primes

Our goal will be to prove that there are infinitely many prickly primes. Recall that this is KindaHardTM. We'd better go easy.

Our goal will be to prove that there are infinitely many prickly primes. Recall that this is KindaHardTM. We'd better go easy.

How many primes are there?

Our goal will be to prove that there are infinitely many prickly primes. Recall that this is KindaHardTM. We'd better go easy.

How many primes are there? ∞

Who is credited with the first proof?

Our goal will be to prove that there are infinitely many prickly primes. Recall that this is KindaHardTM. We'd better go easy.

How many primes are there? ∞

Who is credited with the first proof? Euclid

We'll employ the Doritos proof strategy.

Preliminaries Principles Prickles

Tasty Proof Strategy



æ

≣ ।⊧

- **▲ 🗗 ト** → 🖹

Here are all the primes:

$2, 3, 5, 7, 11, 13, \ldots, 15\,485\,863.$

Here are the first million primes:

 $2, 3, 5, 7, 11, 13, \ldots, 15\,485\,863.$

Convince your neighbor that there is some other prime out there that does not already appear on this list, by building it.



Theorem (Euclid)

There are infinitely many primes.



Sam Vandervelde Prickly Primes

Here are a lot of prickly primes:

 $11, 31, 41, 61, \ldots, 67\,868\,011.$

Convince your neighbor that there is some other prickly prime out there that does not already appear on this list, by building it.



Preliminaries Principles Prickles

That Didn't Go So Well



Sam Vandervelde Prickly Primes

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

Let's try to build a new prickly prime using the first five of them: 11, 31, 41, 61, 71.

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

• P + 1 =

Let's try to build a new prickly prime using the first five of them: 11, 31, 41, 61, 71.

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

•
$$P + 1 = 2^5 \cdot 3^5 \cdot 13 \cdot 599$$

• 10P + 1 =

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

•
$$P + 1 = 2^5 \cdot 3^5 \cdot 13 \cdot 599$$

•
$$10P + 1 = 3^2 \cdot 4657 \cdot 14447$$

•
$$P + 2 =$$

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

•
$$P + 1 = 2^5 \cdot 3^5 \cdot 13 \cdot 599$$

- $10P + 1 = 3^2 \cdot 4657 \cdot 14447$
- $P + 2 = 1303 \cdot 46471$

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

•
$$P + 1 = 2^5 \cdot 3^5 \cdot 13 \cdot 599$$

•
$$10P + 1 = 3^2 \cdot 4657 \cdot 14447$$

- $P + 2 = 1303 \cdot 46471$ but
- $11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 + 2 = 3 \cdot 67 \cdot 4243$

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

•
$$P^2 + 1 =$$

Let's try to build a new prickly prime using the first five of them: 11, 31, 41, 61, 71.

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

P² + 1 = 2 ⋅ 2957 ⋅ 619971204773
10P² + 1 =
That Didn't Go So Well

Let's try to build a new prickly prime using the first five of them: 11, 31, 41, 61, 71.

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

• $P^2 + 1 = 2 \cdot 2957 \cdot 619971204773$ • $10P^2 + 1 = 7 \cdot 5237871007182173$ • $P^2 + 2 =$

That Didn't Go So Well

Let's try to build a new prickly prime using the first five of them: 11, 31, 41, 61, 71.

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

- $P^2 + 1 = 2 \cdot 2957 \cdot 619971204773$ • $10P^2 + 1 = 7 \cdot 5237871007182173$
- $P^2 + 2 = 3 \cdot 163 \cdot 7497974856907$
- $P^3 + 17 =$

That Didn't Go So Well

Let's try to build a new prickly prime using the first five of them: 11, 31, 41, 61, 71.

Let
$$P = 11 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 61 \cdot 71.$$

- $P^2 + 1 = 2 \cdot 2957 \cdot 619971204773$
- $10P^2 + 1 = 7 \cdot 5237871007182173$
- $P^2 + 2 = 3 \cdot 163 \cdot 7497974856907$
- $P^3 + 17 =$ forget it

Preliminaries Principles Prickles

That Didn't Go So Well



n	$n^2 + n + 1$	prime factors	
1	3	3	
2	7	7	What is
3	13	13	going on
4	21	3, 7	with the
5	31	31	primes?
6	43	43	
7	57	3, 19	
8	73	73	
9	91	7, 13	

Sam Vandervelde

Prickly Primes

Here are all the prime factors that occur for numbers of the form $n^2 + n + 1$.

 $3, 7, 13, 19, 31, 37, 43, 61, 67, 73, \ldots$

What do all these primes have in common?

Here are all the prime factors that occur for numbers of the form $n^2 + n + 1$.

 $3, 7, 13, 19, 31, 37, 43, 61, 67, 73, \ldots$

What do all these primes have in common? TIP: it's not about the final digit; rather, it has to do with 3, the first prime in the list.



I'm Convinced

Based on the data we conjecture that for any positive integer n, the only prime factors of

$n^2 + n + 1$

are primes of the form 3k + 1, like

7, 13, 19, 31, 37, 43, \dots

(And possibly a factor of 3.)

I'm Convinced

Based on the data we conjecture that for any positive integer n, the only prime factors of

$n^2 + n + 1$

are primes of the form 3k + 1, like

7, 13, 19, 31, 37, 43, \dots

(And possibly a factor of 3.) That's nice.

Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured?



Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured? Saguaro



What good is knowing about the prime factors of $n^2 + n + 1$?

____ ▶

What good is knowing about the prime factors of $n^2 + n + 1$? Let's call such primes, of the form 3k + 1, *principled primes*.

What good is knowing about the prime factors of $n^2 + n + 1$? Let's call such primes, of the form 3k + 1, *principled primes*.

Theorem

There are infinitely many principled primes.

What good is knowing about the prime factors of $n^2 + n + 1$? Let's call such primes, of the form 3k + 1, *principled primes*.

Theorem

There are infinitely many principled primes.

Remember our proof strategy!



Here are a lot of principled primes:

 $7, 13, 19, 31, 37 \dots, 15\,485\,863.$

Convince your neighbor that there is some other principled prime out there that does not already appear on this list, by building it.



Here's an outline of the argument:

æ

Here's an outline of the argument: • Let $P = (7)(13)(19) \cdots (15\,485\,863)$.

э

- Let $P = (7)(13)(19) \cdots (15\,485\,863)$.
- Compute the positive integer $P^2 + P + 1$.

- Let $P = (7)(13)(19) \cdots (15\,485\,863)$.
- Compute the positive integer $P^2 + P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any principled prime already on the list.

- Let $P = (7)(13)(19) \cdots (15\,485\,863)$.
- Compute the positive integer $P^2 + P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any principled prime already on the list.
- Deal with the (single) factor of 3.

- Let $P = (7)(13)(19) \cdots (15\,485\,863)$.
- Compute the positive integer $P^2 + P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any principled prime already on the list.
- Deal with the (single) factor of 3.
- Deduce a new principled prime exists.

Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured?



Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured? **Golden barrel**



What is so special about $n^2 + n + 1$ that it has only principle prime factors, and why would this polynomial have anything to do with the number 3?

What is so special about $n^2 + n + 1$ that it has only principle prime factors, and why would this polynomial have anything to do with the number 3?

It appears in the factorization

$$n^{3} - 1 = (n - 1)(n^{2} + n + 1).$$

What could this all mean?

Theorem

Every prime factor
$$p$$
 of $n^2 + n + 1$, other
than 3, must be principled, i.e. must be of
the form $p = 3k + 1$.

æ

Theorem

Every prime factor
$$p$$
 of $n^2 + n + 1$, other
than 3, must be principled, i.e. must be of
the form $p = 3k + 1$.

• Given
$$n$$
, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.

æ

Theorem

Every prime factor
$$p$$
 of $n^2 + n + 1$, other
than 3, must be principled, i.e. must be of
the form $p = 3k + 1$.

• Given n, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$. • Therefore $47 | (n^3 - 1)$.

Theorem

Every prime factor
$$p$$
 of $n^2 + n + 1$, other
than 3, must be principled, i.e. must be of
the form $p = 3k + 1$.

- Given n, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $47 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 47$.

- Given n, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $47 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 47$.

- Given n, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $47 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.

- Given n, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $47 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv 1 \mod 47$.

- Given n, suppose $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $47 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- But this gives $n^2 + n + 1 \equiv 3 \mod{47}$,
- which contradicts $47 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.

Why doesn't this eliminate all prime factors?
Why doesn't this eliminate all prime factors? • Given n, suppose $37 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.

- Given *n*, suppose $37 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $37 | (n^3 1)$.

- Given *n*, suppose $37 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $37 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 37$.

- Given n, suppose $37 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $37 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 37$.
- We know $n^{36} \equiv 1 \mod 37$.

- Given n, suppose $37 | (n^2 + n + 1)$.
- Therefore $37 | (n^3 1)$.
- This means that $n^3 \equiv 1 \mod 37$.
- We know $n^{36} \equiv 1 \mod 37$.
- We deduce that $1 \equiv 1 \mod 37$,
- and nothing breaks!

Preliminaries Principles Prickles

Scoring Five Grand



Preliminaries Principles Prickles

Scoring Five Grand

Where shall



we look for it?

Sam Vandervelde

Preliminaries Principles Prickles

Scoring Five Grand

Where shall

GOOD

HUNTERS ATTENTION BOUNTY A polynomial involving P always having prickly factors \$5,000 REWARDI NEAREST LAW ENFORCEMENT AGEN

we look for it?

IDEA!

Who can get us started?

 $n^{10} - 1 =$

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

æ

Who can get us started?

$$n^{10} - 1 = (n^5 - 1)(n^5 + 1)$$

æ

● ▶ ▲ ●

Who can get us started?

$$\begin{array}{rcl} n^{10}-1 &=& (n^5-1)(n^5+1) \\ (n^5-1) &=& \end{array}$$

æ

● ▶ ▲ ●

Who can get us started?

$$\begin{array}{rcl} n^{10}-1 &=& (n^5-1)(n^5+1) \\ (n^5-1) &=& (n-1)(n^4+n^3+n^2+n+1) \\ (n^5+1) &=& \end{array}$$

æ

● ▶ ▲ ●

Who can get us started?

$$\begin{array}{rcl} n^{10}-1 &=& (n^5-1)(n^5+1) \\ (n^5-1) &=& (n-1)(n^4+n^3+n^2+n+1) \\ (n^5+1) &=& (n+1)(n^4-n^3+n^2-n+1) \end{array}$$

Which of those quartics shall we use?

Who can get us started?

$$n^{10} - 1 = (n^5 - 1)(n^5 + 1)$$

$$(n^5 - 1) = (n - 1)(n^4 + n^3 + n^2 + n + 1)$$

$$(n^5 + 1) = (n + 1)(n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1)$$

Which of those quartics shall we use? *Either one will do.* Let's give it a try!

Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured?



Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured? San Pedro



n	$n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1$	prime factors
12	19141	19141
13	26521	11, 241
14	35855	5, 71, 101
15	47461	31, 1531
16	61681	61681
17	78881	11, 71, 101
18	99451	11, 9041

æ

<ロト < 団 > < 団 > < 団 > < 団 >

Let's try out a SICKLY prime. • Suppose $47 | (n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1)$.

э

Let's try out a SICKLY prime.

• Suppose
$$47 | (n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1).$$

• Therefore $47 | (n^5 + 1)$.

- Suppose $47 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $47 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 47$.

- Suppose $47 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $47 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.

- Suppose $47 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $47 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 47$.

- Suppose $47 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $47 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 47$.
- Hence $n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1 \equiv 5 \mod{47}$,

- Suppose $47 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $47 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 47$.
- We know $n^{46} \equiv 1 \mod 47$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 47$.
- Hence $n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1 \equiv 5 \mod{47}$,
- Contrary to $47 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$

No doubt TRICKY and FICKLE primes work out the same way, and we're done, right?

No doubt TRICKY and FICKLE primes work out the same way, and we're done, right?

Aw, cmon, don't you trust me?

No doubt TRICKY and FICKLE primes work out the same way, and we're done, right?

Aw, cmon, don't you trust me?

Fine, we'll do one more case together, then you can confirm the last one on your own. Which type of prime shall we tackle next?

Great, here's a TRICKY prime. • Suppose $83 | (n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1)$.

э

Great, here's a TRICKY prime.

• Suppose
$$83 | (n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1).$$

• Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 83$.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- Hence $n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1 \equiv 5 \mod 83$,

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- Hence $n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1 \equiv 5 \mod 83$,
- Contrary to $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- Hence $n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1 \equiv 5 \mod 83$,

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
Great, here's a TRICKY prime.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n^2 \equiv 1 \mod 83$.

Great, here's a TRICKY prime.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv \pm 1 \mod 83$.

Great, here's a TRICKY prime.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv \pm 1 \mod 83$.

• So $n^4 - n^3 + n^2 - n + 1 \equiv 1,5 \mod 83$,

Great, here's a TRICKY prime.

- Suppose $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$
- Therefore $83 | (n^5 + 1)$.
- This means that $n^5 \equiv -1 \mod 83$.
- We know $n^{82} \equiv 1 \mod 83$.
- We deduce that $n \equiv \pm 1 \mod 83$.
- So $n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1 \equiv 1,5 \mod 83$,
- Contrary to $83 | (n^4 n^3 + n^2 n + 1).$

We're Home Free Now

You should now be able to dispatch the FICKLE case with ease.

We're Home Free Now

You should now be able to dispatch the FICKLE case with ease.

Nothing can stop us now in our quest to demonstrate that there are infinitely many prickly primes.

Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured?



Prickly Review

What type of cactus is pictured? **Barbary Fig**



Prickle or Bust

Theorem

There are infinitely many prickly primes.

Remember our proof strategy!



Prickle or Bust

Theorem

There are infinitely many prickly primes.

Remember our proof strategy!

Here are a lot of prickly primes:



 $11, 31, 41, 61, \ldots, 67\,868\,011.$

Let's prove that there exists a prickly prime that does not already appear on this list.

Here's an outline of the argument:

æ

Here's an outline of the argument: • Let $P = (5)(11)(31) \cdots (67\,868\,011)$.

э

- Let $P = (5)(11)(31) \cdots (67\,868\,011)$.
- Compute $P^4 P^3 + P^2 P + 1$.

- Let $P = (5)(11)(31) \cdots (67\,868\,011)$.
- Compute $P^4 P^3 + P^2 P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any prickly prime already on the list.

- Let $P = (5)(11)(31) \cdots (67\,868\,011)$.
- Compute $P^4 P^3 + P^2 P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any prickly prime already on the list.
- Finess the factors of 2 and 5

- Let $P = (5)(11)(31) \cdots (67\,868\,011)$.
- Compute $P^4 P^3 + P^2 P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any prickly prime already on the list.
- Finess the factors of 2 and 5
- Deduce a new prickly prime exists.

- Let $P = (5)(11)(31) \cdots (67\,868\,011)$.
- Compute $P^4 P^3 + P^2 P + 1$.
- Argue this value is not divisible by any prickly prime already on the list.
- Finess the factors of 2 and 5
- Deduce a new prickly prime exists.
- And You're Done!

See You Tomorrow



Thanks for being such a great audience!

Sam Vandervelde Prickly Primes

< ロ > < 部 > < 注 > < 注 > < </p>